

THE EMERGENCE OF SHIITE IN MALAYSIAN CYBERSPACE: A STUDY OF MAIN THEME IN THE POSTINGS OF PRO-SHIITES' FACEBOOK

Muhamad Faisal Ashaari & Mohd Azmir Maideen
The Faculty of Islamic Studies
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia
faisal@ukm.edu.my

ABSTRACT

The rapid emergence of new media has shifted the way to convey the idea and disseminate information as it could reach the potential target group across boundaries. Indeed, Shia has utilised this medium to convey their theological thought to public especially the heavy users of the Internet and young people. This study gives an overview of the emergence of Shia in Malaysian Cyberspace. Specifically, it examines the extent of Shia ideas are highlighted in the posting of Pro-Shiites' Facebook in Malaysia. A total of 10 Facebook accounts of Pro-Shiites are chosen as sample in this study to examine the frequent theme posted on their Facebook. The qualitative study has been used to analyse these Facebook accounts and the data were taken from April - July 2016. Nine themes of discourse have been examined in these Facebooks' account. The study found that the most frequent theme highlighted is "news and information related to Shia". Then, it follows by "the beautiful words and the good advices"; and "Prayer, rituals and dzikir of Shia". The rest six last themes are similarly captured in the posting.

INTRODUCTION

The social media has been developed at a great development in our time and it has changes many facets of our way of life especially in communication process and in dissemination of ideas. This medium has many advantages especially in its ability in integrating all graphic elements, including audio and video that can adopt and adapt all media tools in communication. For example, Facebook has all elements of interactions and it is completed with text, audio and video, both synchronously and asynchronously. All these advantages have empowered the ability of Facebook to influence public perception particularly when the public uses it widely. Therefore, Facebook becomes a medium for a small group of people or business to be seen as a big group.

Shiites in Malaysia have found themselves marginalized in the Malaysian society and depressed by the laws. Actually, they are allowed to practice their belief but only they are prohibited to disseminate Shia theological thoughts to public. Thus their movement and activities are closely monitored and observed by the authorities. As an alternative, they use the Facebook intensively to voice up their rights and to struggle for their position. This medium has a less constraint from legal perspective and it is a cost efficient because Malaysia has an open sky policy. This medium could help them to convey the idea of Shia indirectly because the direct conveyance is prohibited. This article attempts to explain the issues often raised by pro-Shiites in Malaysia through their Facebook.

THE STRUGGLE OF SHIA IN MALAYSIA

The dissemination of the Shia theological thought in Malaysia has caused a small discomfort among Muslim Sunnites in this country. It can be viewed from four perspectives. Firstly, the ideology of Shia is in contrast to the majority Muslim Sunnite community in this country who are holding *Ahl al-Sunnah wa al-Jamaah* (ASWJ) school of thought. The dissemination of new religious thought that is different to the current practice in terms of belief and ritual can lead to misunderstanding about Islam and it can break the unity of Muslims in Malaysia. Secondly, the Shia is not merely a sect in Islam, but it is a movement associated with the expansion of political influence, which can cause problems of national security, such as the demonstration in Saudi Arabia (Matthiesen, 2012) and in Bahrain (Gengler, 2012). Thirdly, the bloody crisis in Syria since 2014 that comprises inhumane actions has given a bad impression toward Shia in the eye of Malaysian. There are news about this crisis disseminated in the new media and WhatsApp that aroused a public concern. Fourthly, the public statement of Shia activist in Malaysia that the Shiite community in Malaysia is totalled over 200 thousand people (Kamil Zuhairi, 2011) has surprised many sides. Although the truth of this statement is disputed by some, it could be classified was a "psywar" in attracting the attention of certain parties especially authorities toward Shiites in Malaysia. Based on the at least four above scenario, Shia theological thoughts are difficult to penetrate the Malaysian Muslim community.

The Shiites have a difficulty to setup their movement in public because of the legal standpoint and the difference type of the practices and beliefs from the majority population of Malaysia. The interpretation of the Federal

Constitution and Laws that limits Islam is only to Sunni, makes Shiites movement a bit cramped. In other words, the laws do not favour them for propagation purposes, but the constitution grants for private practice. Based on legal constraints and the public cynicism toward Shiite groups in Malaysia, they have submitted a memorandum to The Human Rights Commission of Malaysia (SUHAKAM) and also the Yang di-Pertuan Agong. They try to get the attention for not ignoring their right as the minority group, but until now no any visible positive development from that memorandum.

Even though the idea of Shia has been infiltrated to Malaysia since late 70s, Shiites remain struggling to be recognized a sect in Islam and as a part in Muslim community (Chandra Muzafar, 1987). Malaysia only recognizes Sunnites school of thought, not Shia. They had tried many ways including meeting physically with many high authority people and distributing printed material to convince the public, but they receive more pressures from the authority and protest from public to stop the movement. Therefore, since 1990 the movement of Shi'ism has been slowed down especially with the legal constraints and social barriers.

However, with the emergence of the new media Shiites have opportunity to approach public especially young people known as “Y” generation and middle class of society. They are heavy users of the Internet and they may have no or little information about Shi'ism, thus they could be easily approached via this medium. The mission is at least to get recognition as a part in Muslim community. Taking into account all the above scenarios, the effort to expand the influence of Shiite through the new media became a new alternative way for Shiite propagation. To date, Shiites are struggling to appear as a sect, which is legally recognized and accepted within the framework of the legal system in Malaysia.

The advent of the new media especially Facebook have provided an alternative medium for them to achieve their goals. A study conducted by Mohd Naim (2013) showed an increasing interaction among Facebookers who are perceived as Shiites. This finding cannot be underestimated, as Facebook could be the potential and an effective communication medium for Shia propagation. The Facebook can adapt all methods of propagating Shia that can provide social and psychological impact of Facebook users.

SHIA ACTIVITIES IN MALAYSIA CYBERSPACE

Shia appears in Malaysian cyberspace through two main mediums; blogs and Facebook. Prior to Facebook, blogs have been widely used to share information about Shia and convey their messages. There is a number of Shia Malay-language blog such as <http://www.shia-explained.com/my>, which promotes activities and conveys information and news related to Shia. On top of that, blog and website are the medium used to help Shiite struggling to establish as a recognized group in Malaysia. By the coming of social media especially Facebook last decade, it extensively used in Malaysia by 2010. It has drowned the popularity of blogs because most users are more interested to interactive communication as in Facebook rather than blog.

Actually, Facebook has two types of accounts; “personal Facebook” and “Facebook Page”. The first is normally interactive but the number of the friend shall not more than five thousands. The second can have unlimited followers but slightly directive communication because only the owner can write on the main wall. Through personal Facebook account type, there are a few Shiites disclose their real identity in the Facebook, Meanwhile, there are some users who deliberately hide their identity for some reasons; By anonymous status, they could convey the idea of Shia to others without disclosing their original identity, thus the Shiites can be propagated Shi'ism to others unconsciously. It can be said that the Facebook presence has given a new impetus to the Shia because the medium is so open and they are free to interact with each other, including seeking new followers without having to meet physically. The feedback from this online interaction could indicate the extent of Shia accepted by the local community. According to Muhamad Faisal et.al (2013), since the target group in cyberspace is too wide, and at the same time, they still receive many responses it means that the idea of Shia is accepted. However, to examine the extent of this group needs another further research.

However, the advent of Shia in Malaysian cyberspace has received a negative response from local community. In turn, those who are not uncomfortable with Shia developed some blogs against Shiites; either using a hard approach like <http://gerakanantisyyiahmalaysia.blogspot.com/> or soft approaches such <http://duniasyiah.blogspot.com/>. Therefore, since 2013, these blogs have been slowly disappeared due to the pressure from the local community against Shiite community in Malaysia. Besides of the pressure, people more likely to use Facebook.

METHODOLOGY

Ten Facebook accounts have been selected purposively as the sample in this study. There are nine themes of discourse that can convey the idea of Shia namely, the beautiful words and the good advices; Prayer, rituals and

dzikir; articulating the victory of the members of al-Bait and 12 Imamates of Shia; the local and international news and information of Shia; the traitor to members al-Bait; the signs of al-Mahdi; Wahhabism as opponent to Shia; reducing gap between Shia and Sunni; and the jurisprudence of Shia. All these items are pertinent issues in Shia school of thought that would attract people to Shia or at least could lead to sympathy and compassion to “the members of al-Bait” and Shia respectively.

Table 1: Nine Themes of Discourse Related to Shia

No.	Types of Theme	Details
1	The beautiful words and the good advices	Articulated by “members of al-bait” and Imamates Shia
2	Prayer, rituals and dzikir	Perform by the members of al-bait and Imamates Shia
3	The members of al-Bait and 12 Imamates	Mentions the origin of al-Bait decent and the victory
4	News and information of current situation of Shia	Local and international news
5	The traitor to “Ahli al-Bait”	The history of Shia
6	The signs of emergence of al-Mahdi	The story of al-Mahdi in Shia’s version
7	Wahhabi /opponent of Shia	
8	Reducing gap	To reduce the gap between Sunnites and Shia
9	Islamic jurisprudence of Shia	Islamic laws from Shia legal point of view

These accounts belong to the active supporters of Shia in Malaysia, in which four of them are “page”, while the rest are personal Facebook. This article presents an analysis of the qualitative content analysis of 20 posts from these Facebook from April 2016 to July 2016. The list of Pro Shiite Facebook selected in this study as follows.

Table 2: List of the Selected Facebook Account of Pro Shia

No	Facebook	Date founded	Type	Total like/ friend
1	Muhammad Mahdi Abdulrahman	20-Nov-09	Profile	1 214
2	Encik Hyde @ Encik Jekyll	13-Nov-14	Profile	3 389
3	Mas Alan @ Akmar Shamsul	10-Mar-14	Profile	3 218
4	John Ramond	15-Jul-09	Profile	4 461
5	Mohd Kamilzuhairi Abdul Aziz	15-Feb-13	Fanpage	52 092
6	Assajjad Movement	19-Mar-13	Fanpage	1 201
7	Halimi Al Muntazar	24-Sep-12	Profile	4 543
8	Misbah Misykat	28-Nov-10	Profile	2 203
9	Zainal Abidin Salleh	9-Mar-11	Profile	4 414
10	Zainal Ali	16-Nov-09	Profile	1 830

Table 2 above lists down Pro-Shiite Facebooks chosen as samples for this study. All of them have friends or likers below than 5000 except Facebook belongs to Mohd Kamilzuhairi who has 52,092 likers. Nevertheless, these friends or likers are not necessarily pro-Shiites because there are many possibilities including stalkers and haters to Shia. Most of them are perceived holding the teaching of Imamiyyah except Muhammad Mahdi Abdulrahman who claim as a “supporter to Imam Mahdi” who is the follower for Ahmad al-Hassan whom is considered as heretic by Imamiyah. All of them use nickname except Mohd Kamilzuhairi Abdul Aziz and Assajjad Movement. Mohd Kamilzuhairi is an activist of Shia who is critically voice up issues related to Shia in Malaysia. He is a chairman for Muslim Shia Community in Malaysia. While, Assajjad Movement is a Shia organization chaired by M. S. Hussain who uses Facebook to voice up the rights of minority group in Malaysia. This group plays a crucial role as a pressure group for Shia community in Malaysia. According to Abdul Hamid (2014) they get support from COMANGO (Coalition of Malaysian Human Rights NGOs) and one of its reports is demanding the Malaysian government to give the freedom to disseminate Shia among Muslims in Malaysia.

Table 3: The frequency of posting according to category

No.	Facebook	Type of theme								
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
1	Muhammad Mahdi Abdulrahman	4		2		5	9			
2	Encik Hyde	9	4	3	1			3		
3	Mas Alan @ Akmar Shamsul	3			7		1		4	5
4	John Ramond	2	2	2	12			1		1
5	Mohd Kamilzuhairi Abdul Aziz	2	1	1	9	1	1	2	1	2
6	Assajjad Movement	1	1		12	1		3	2	
7	Halimi Al Muntazar	5	2	1	2	5	1	1	3	
8	Misbah Misykat	1	2	1	7			6	1	2
9	Zainal Abidin Salleh	4	2	1	2	3	1	1	3	3
10	Zainal Ali	6	7	3	1	1				2
	Jumlah	37	21	14	53	16	13	17	14	15

Table 3 above reveals the distribution and frequency of the issues raised by each account of Facebook. Two of them, KamilZuhairi and Zainal Abidin, touch all themes while the rest only touch the selected theme. They may focus on the selected theme because the online communication needs the focus in communication. People know the niche of the Facebook.

THE THEME OF DISCOURSE THAT CONVEY THE IDEA OF SHIA

Generally, not all themes received the similar attention from the selected Facebookers. That may have different focus because to cattle to the themes need not a little efforts as shown in Table 4.

Table 4: Types of Theme and Times Mentioned

No.	Types of Theme	Times mentioned
1	The beautiful words and the good advices	37
2	Prayer, rituals and dzikir	21
3	The members of al-Bait and 12 Imamates	14
4	News and information of current situation of Shia	53
5	The traitor to “Ahli al-Bait”	16
6	The signs of emergence of al-Mahdi	13
7	Wahhabi /opponent of Shia	17
8	Reducing gap	14
9	Islamic jurisprudence of Shia	15

Table 4 above shows nine themes mentioned in the pro-Shiites Facebook to approach the new “Y” and “Z” generation. Only three themes got the pertinent attention from the Facebookers namely news and information, the beautiful words; and Prayer, rituals and dzikir. While others get the moderate attention from them. Below is discussion on each theme.

1. The beautiful words and the good advices

It is word from the Shia Clerics consisting of “members of al-Bait” and the infallible Imams. The words include advices, speeches, wills, teaching and wisdom that can raise awareness and consciousness toward Islam, which are found in their books such as “Bihar Al-Anwar” and “Nahj al-Balagha”. The ultimate aim of these words is to promote the beauty of the teachings in Shia. Besides, it also shows their admiration for their clerics and “members of al-Bait” and their descendants. These words sent in Facebook as a tool to touch the emotions and feelings of the Internet users and attract them to approach Shia. Generally, people are more interested to the beautiful words and appreciate precious phrases or sentence. According to Muhamad Faisal and Nur Adwa (2014), using the beautiful words in the Facebook’s posting is a marketing technique to attract people’s attention especially when the words articulated by the respected Imam or Sheikh. On top of that, people are more interested to the beautiful image portrayed in attractive image. They always like, give comment and share it.

People have no any subtle reason to refute these words because it consists of noble idea and good value for all human being. It does not highlight the theological part of Shia and does not call to embrace Shia directly. Only these words are belong to personalities of Shia cleric that may attract people to Shia. People may believe that these beautiful words describe the good personalities of the owner of these words. Without any prejudice, they do not only accept these personalities, but simultaneously they may accept their ideology.

The analysis found that this item is the second most popular category of theme in the selected Facebooks. Both Encik Hyde and Zainal Ali send 9 and 6 posting throughout the period of the study. It indicates the beautiful word is a subtle approach to propagate the idea of Shia. Both are active in promoting the ideology of Shia compared to other Facebook account. Although this is most suitable method of online persuasion, not all Facebooks use this method because the quotation of Imam's words should be in line with other postings. The contradiction should be avoided. For example, in one hand, the posting is about the patience and the good advices, but in other hand, the posting is regarding political issues, voicing rights and sometimes using the hard word. Therefore, only the certain Facebook always share the beautiful words in posting, while others only use this method selectively when suitable.

2. Prayer, rituals and dzikir

This item composes of prayers, practices and rituals performed by the Shia clerics consisting of the members of al-Bait and Shiite Imams. It includes pray for "Imam last day", remembrance, practices for identifying Imam Mahdi and so on. It also comprises tips such as health care tips by Imam Ja'far al-Sadiq like eating quince fruit to strengthen memory and consuming pomegranates to accelerate the maturity of the child. There are also post items relating to *selawat* and *syahadah* according to the teachings of the Shia that would normally be responded by Shiite with the greeting "solawat!". This is the third highest item among all themes of posting. It means that showing the ritual of Shia and the practice could attract the attention of people to Shia. This item only reveals the selected prayer and dzikir from clerics of Shia. These rituals do not involve the discussion related to the thought that may receive many questions.

3. "The members of al-Bait" and 12 Shiite Imams

Loving "the members of al-Bait" is among the teachings in Islam because they are the family of the Prophet. This is accepted by Sunnites. However, Shiite uses this practice as a tool for disseminating idea of Shia by articulating the privileges and advantages of "the members of al-Bait". It can activate feelings of loving The Prophet and his families. The verses of al-Quran and Hadith about these advantages are regularly repeated to lure the attention in one hand, and to stress the need to love the Prophet's family members on the other hand.

This is followed by a sad story happened to the kids' Ali to capture people's emotion. For example, the persecution of "the members of the al-Bait", poetry praising the members of al-Bait and 12 Shia Imam, Hadith regarding the virtues of the members of al-Bait, born the members of al-Bait and the infallible Imams, song for the members of al-Bait, and so on. Therefore, to attract attention and to arouse the curiosity of the public, the members of al-Bait issue often raised, where there are Hadith from Sunnite sources and the verses of the Qur'an that describe the privileges of The members of al-Bait. They explained that the verse in Surah al-Ahzab verse 33 that reveals the words "The members of al-Bait" means Ali, Hassan, Hussein and Fatima and does not include spouses and other relatives of the Prophet. This verse is the important argument for the Shia that indicates the infallible (preserved from sin) to Ali, Hassan, Hussein and Fatima in turn connected to the Imam Mahdi. This theme receive a moderate attention from the Facebookers.

4. News and information of current situation of Shia

The current issue can be categorised into local and international issues. Supporters of Shia in Facebook mostly raised the international issues because during the period of the study, the war in Syria was just exploded and involved three Shia related countries; namely Iran, Lebanon and Syria. The Shiites were seen as giving support to the Syrian government and called rebels or *da'ish* as terrorist. They also called Free Syrian Army (FSA) as Wahabi and Israeli stooge because between Shia and Wahabi has a long story of quarrel. As for local issue, it is like the suggestion from the former Malaysian Prime Minister, Mahathir Mohamad and the former Iranian President, Seyyed Mohammad Khatami to parties involve in Syrian War to ceasefire. The war involves the death of many innocent people and simultaneously it could tarnish the image of Islam and Muslims. However, this statement was interpreted as the call for the unification of Sunni-Shiite. Actually, the suggestion is not aimed at uniting Shia and Sunni sect but the aim is at halting the bloodshed that happened in the world and strife. This is the highest theme written in the selected Facebookers namely 53 times.

5. The trait to “the members of al-Bait”

Another theme raised in the posting is about the story of the traits against the members of al-Bait. It refers to events that restrain the appointment of the Caliphate Ali, the murder of Imam Ali by Khariijite and murder of some members of the al-Bait especially in Karbala'. It includes the attitudes of some Companions of the Prophet who did not recognize the Caliphate Ali, especially in the cursed descendants of Abu Sufyan especially The Caliphate Yazid. They also raised doubts on trustworthy friends by the allegations and stories that are not as good as said that Abu Bakr al-Siddiq has issued a fatwa that condemned him when he ordered the Muslims who do not pay zakat killed. Similarly, the title of al-Siddiq claimed a title that should be given to 'Ali. They also claim that Umar Al-Khattab changed pronouncement Azan from *Hayya ala solah* to "العَمَلُ حَيٌّ عَلَى خَيْرٍ" which is actually is an original command of the Prophet. Besides, they also denounce the descendants of Abu Sufyan, highlight Mu'awiah crimes and deny the leadership of Abu Bakr al-Siddiq and his followers. This theme receive a moderate attention from the Facebookers.

6. al-Mahdi and its signs

Shia also has a belief of the emergence of Imam al-Mahdi at the end time as in Sunnite. It includes the story of the emergence of Imam Ahmad al-Yamani, the allegiance on the army of Black Flag from Khurasan, the emergence of *qo'im al-hujjah* (enforcement Hujjah), *sahib al-amr* (the leader) and an executor of the Mahdi. The idea of al-Mahdi is significant for Shia is due to this Imam will lead the world with justice and peace; to empower justice and defeat the cruelty. He also has a special position in Shia as the “saviour of mankind” to defeat the opponents who are considered as Dajjal.

According to Shia, al-Mahdi is the twelfth Imam of “the members of al-bayt” and he is the son of Hasan al-Askari. They argue that al-Askari has a son but he disappears and will come back as al-Mahdi at the end time. Shia also believes that the Islamic laws will only complete with the leadership of this Imam. Meanwhile, Sunnites also have a different version of the emergence of al-Mahdi, in which they do not put all the solution of troubles in this world to this imam. Nevertheless, both Sunni Muslims and Shia are awaiting a person whose is referred to as Imam al-Mahdi. However, both the identity and characteristics of the Mahdi of the Sunnis are significantly different from the identity and characteristics of Shia's Imam Mahdi. This theme receives a moderate attention from the Facebookers.

7. Wahhabism is opponent to Shia

Wahhabism is the biggest opponents to Shia because both hold different ways of understanding Islam in its nature. Wahhabism is a school of thought that applies the literal approach in understanding the al-Quran and the Tradition. Meanwhile, Shia holds the emotional approach because this school of thought always concern with the early history of members of al-Bait who were depressed and murdered. Both approaches are contradicted thus is not surprising if each demonizes between each other. According to Wahhabism point of view, the emergence of Shia brings a wrong way of understanding Islam and this should be avoided in Muslims society. This theme receives a moderate attention from the Facebookers. In line to shift from traditional Shia quietism (non-radicalism) to revolutionary Khomeinism, ASWJ attacks on Shia also caused a shift from small-scale Shiite apologetics intended for internal usage to large scale Shiite proselytization.

8. Reducing gap between Sunnites and Shiites

It is a deliberate attempt to highlight similarities between Sunnites and Shiites to demonstrate that Shia is a recognized sect in Islam. They always be highlighted the difference is in some practices, not in the fundamental aspect of belief. On top of that, a few of Sunnite Imam such as Imam Hanafi studied with Imam Ja'far al-Sadiq (the sixth Imam of the Shia sect). Therefore, there is a sect of Shia called as Ja'fariah, the sect pledged to Imam Ja'fari. Shiite also argued if Shia is not from Islam, why they are still allowed to perform the pilgrimage in Mecca, while unbelievers cannot be allowed enter the Holy Land. Besides, they also spread the Amman Message (Amman Message), a Memorandum of Understanding signed by a large number of Ulama and Muslim leaders from around the world where the leaflet explaining the Shiite as one of the legitimate sect in Islam. This brochure was made by supporters of the Shia as an argument to persuade Sunnites to unite in forming a consensus. In short, Shiites give the effort in calling people to recognize Shia as an accepted sect in Islam and consistently attempts to eliminate the gap between Sunni and Shia. This theme receives a moderate attention from the Facebookers.

9. The Islamic jurisprudence of Shia

It explains aspects of the practice of the Shiite perspective such as prayer, charity, pilgrimage and marriage. The practice should be brought to the public to inform them with religious practices from Shia perspective. This theme receives a moderate attention from the selected Facebookers. Indeed this item should be given an attention because the intention is to disseminate the idea of Shia. However, this has received a low attention may because the priority is given to the theological aspect rather than jurisdictional aspect. The main interesting part in Shia version of Islamic laws is the temporary marriage contract (*al-mut'ah*). A man can marry with women even in three hours and then that woman is divorced. It seems for sexual purpose only. However, this item is never posted in the Facebook may because this item is not accepted as a noble value among Muslims in Malaysia.

CONCLUSION

In Malaysia, Shiite cannot arbitrarily disseminate the idea of Shia because it is not lawful here. Basically, Malaysia permits other religions to be practiced even in the public such as Buddhism, Hinduism and Christianity including Shia. This prohibition also includes the Malaysian cyberspace because the cyberspace is a reflection to the real world especially, when the Facebook is used for the sake of propagation. Therefore, Shiites use indirect call to Shia because it is cost efficient and this space also is really promising as it has many technical constraints to be found guilty. This study found three themes that received many postings from pro-Shia Facebookers, while the rest theme received a moderate posting. No generalization can be made from this finding, because this is a qualitative study. However, the three items are significant to be explored in the qualitative studies, as it is in line with the technique of online da'wah. Generally, the supporters of Shia use Facebook not only for friendship purpose, but also for propagation. They have truly given a full effort to disseminate Shia thought even though they realized that not all people could accept.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research was supported by Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (FRGS) FRGS/2/2013/SSI03/UKM/03/4

REFERENCES

- Ashaari, M. F., & Saparudin, N. A. F. (2012). Kriteria newsworthiness dalam entri Facebook dakwah. *Islamiyyat: Jurnal Antarabangsa Pengajian Islam*, 34, 45-51.
- Abdul Hamid, M. (2014). Hubungan Antara Kaum Melalui Rang Undang-Undang Harmoni. Paper presented at the Seminar Kebangsaan Islam dan Tajdid, Unisel. Shah Alam.
- Muzafar, C. (1987). *Islamic Resurgence in Malaysia*. Petaling Jaya: Penerbit Fajar Bakti Sdn. Bhd.
- Gengler, J. (2012). *Bahrain's Sunni Awakening*. Middle East Research and Information Project.
- Kamilzuhairi. (2011). Memorandum kepada YDP Agong, bertarikh 6 Jun 2011.
- Matthiesen, T. (2012). A "Saudi Spring?": The Shia Protest Movement in the Eastern Province 2011-2012. *The Middle East Journal*, 66(4): 628-659.
- Saad, M.N.. (2013). *Penggunaan Media Baru oleh Penganut Syiah di Malaysia*. Latihan Ilmiah, Jabatan Pengajian Dakwah dan Kepimpinan, UKM.
- Ashaari, M.F., Saad, M.N., Puteh, A., & Mohamad, A.B.,. (2013). *Isu-Isu Seputar Syiah di Facebook Pro-Syiah Malaysia*. Prosiding Nadwah Ulama Nusantara (NUN) V: Ulama dan Cabaran Idealisme Semasa.